



State of New Jersey

DEPARTMENT OF THE TREASURY
DIVISION OF PURCHASE AND PROPERTY
OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR
33 WEST STATE STREET
P. O. BOX 039
TRENTON, NEW JERSEY 08625-0039

CHRIS CHRISTIE
Governor

ANDREW P. SIDAMON-ERISTOFF
State Treasurer

KIM GUADAGNO
Lt. Governor

JIGNASA DESAI-MCCLEARY
Director

Telephone (609) 292-4886 / Facsimile (609) 984-2575

June 24, 2014

Via Electronic Mail [carmel.flanagan@ipaper.com] and USPS Regular Mail

Ms. Carmel Flanagan
xpedx Government Division
One Penn Plaza, Suite 2814
New York, NJ 10119

RE: Protest of Notice of Proposal Rejection
RFP #15-X-23476 Food Service Items, Disposable, Paper & Plastic — DSS

Dear Ms. Flanagan:

This letter is in response to your email¹ received June 19, 2014, referencing the subject Request for Proposal (“RFP”) and regarding the proposal submitted by xpedx, a division of International Paper, (“xpedx”) to the Division of Purchase and Property (“the Division”). The record of this procurement notes that xpedx’s proposal was rejected for absence of a completed *Disclosure of Investment Activities in Iran* form. Your letter contends that xpedx properly submitted all Standard RFP Forms through the Division’s eBid system, and that these forms were accepted in hard copy form in the past.

I have reviewed the record of this procurement, including the RFP, xpedx’s proposal, and relevant statutes, regulations, and case law. This review has provided me with the information necessary to determine the facts of this matter and to render an informed determination on the merits of xpedx’s protest.

The Division’s records indicate that xpedx submitted an electronic proposal through the eBid system by the proposal submission date of June 12, 2014. Following the proposal opening, xpedx received a *Notice of Proposal Rejection* indicating its proposal was rejected due to submission of a “not signed or completed” *Disclosure of Investment Activities in Iran* form. Following a review of your proposal and the Division records, it appears that, in addition to failing to complete the *Disclosure of Investment Activities in Iran* form, xpedx does not have a properly completed *Ownership Disclosure Form* that was filed within the six months prior to this proposal opening.

¹ Your email correspondence is accepted as a letter of protest.

The above-referenced solicitation was comprised of the RFP and other documents, one of which was the three-part document titled *NJ Standard RFP Forms*. This document is comprised of three expandable forms, including an *Ownership Disclosure Form*, a *Disclosure of Investigations and Other Actions Involving Bidder Form*, and a *Disclosure of Investment Activities in Iran form*.

The text of the RFP addresses these forms in Section 4.0, *Proposal Preparation and Submission*. The relevant text reads as follows:

4.4.1.2 NJ Standard RFP Forms

One of the downloadable RFP documents is titled NJ STANDARD RFP FORMS. It is comprised of three separate forms, two of which (Ownership Disclosure and Disclosure of Investment Activities in Iran) discussed below, must be completed, signed and submitted with the bidder's proposal. **The bidder is cautioned that failure to complete, sign and submit either of these two forms will be cause to reject its proposal as non-responsive as noted below.** If the bidder submits a hard copy proposal, each of the two forms must be physically signed.

If the bidder is submitting an electronic proposal through the Division's eBid system, there are only two acceptable forms of signature for the two forms:

1. The bidder may download the document, physically complete and sign each form, scan the completed document and then upload it, or
2. The bidder may download the document, type the name of the signatory in the space designated for certification signature in each of the forms and then upload the document.

Note: A bidder's entry of a Personal Identification Number (PIN) will not suffice as a signature on these two forms. A signed RFP Signatory Page is also not an acceptable substitute for signature on these two forms.

4.4.1.2.1 Ownership Disclosure Form

Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 52:25-24.2, in the event the bidder is a corporation, partnership or sole proprietorship, the bidder must complete and sign the attached Ownership Disclosure Form. A current completed Ownership Disclosure Form must be received prior to or accompany the submitted proposal. A bidder's failure to submit the completed and signed form with its proposal will result in the rejection of the proposal as non-responsive and preclude the award of a contract to said bidder unless the Division has on file a signed and accurate Ownership Disclosure Form dated and received no more than six months prior to the proposal submission deadline for this procurement. If any ownership change has occurred within the last six months, a new Ownership Disclosure Form must be completed, signed and submitted with the proposal.

4.4.1.2.2 Disclosure of Investment Activities in Iran Form

Pursuant to N.J.S.A. 52:32-58, the bidder must utilize this Disclosure of Investment Activities in Iran form to certify that neither the bidder, nor one of its parents, subsidiaries, and/or affiliates (as defined in N.J.S.A. 52:32-56(e)(3)), is listed on the Department of the Treasury's List of Persons or Entities Engaging in Prohibited Investment Activities in Iran and that neither the bidder, nor one of its parents, subsidiaries, and/or affiliates, is involved in any of the investment activities set forth in N.J.S.A. 52:32-56(f). If the bidder is unable to so certify,

the bidder shall provide a detailed and precise description of such activities as directed on the form. A bidder's failure to submit the completed and signed form with its proposal will result in the rejection of the proposal as nonresponsive and preclude the award of a contract to said bidder.

[(Emphasis in original.)]

Pursuant to N.J.A.C. 17:12-2.2,² a bidder's proposal must "[c]ontain all RFP-required certifications, forms, and attachments, completed and signed as required" or "be subject to automatic rejection." As set forth in RFP Sections 4.4.1.2, 4.4.1.2.1, and 4.4.1.2.2 listed above, the submission of a completed and signed *Ownership Disclosure Form* prior to or as part of the proposal and a completed and signed *Disclosure of Investment Activities in Iran* form as part of a bidder's proposal was required for the subject RFP.

In this case, the record indicates that xpedx's proposal submission did not include a properly signed *Ownership Disclosure Form* or *Disclosure of Investment Activities in Iran* form. Rather, the signature lines on these forms were left blank. Notwithstanding xpedx's interest in competing for this procurement, it would not be in the State's best interests to allow a bidder who did not provide the required completed and signed certifications to be eligible to participate in the procurement process. Such acceptance would unlevel the bidders' playing field, as the State received responsive proposals in which certifications were provided as required. In light of the findings set forth above, I must deny your request for eligibility to participate in the competition for the subject contract. This is my final agency decision on this matter.

This is an unfortunate situation for the State, as the Division encourages competition and appreciates the time and effort put forth in the preparation of xpedx's proposal. Thank you for your interest in doing business with the State of New Jersey and for registering your business with **NJ START** at www.njstart.gov, the State of New Jersey's new eProcurement system.

Sincerely,



Ronald G. Wengerd
Chief Hearing Officer

RGW:DF

c: L. DuBois
R. Sharbaugh
J. Signoretta
G. Gerstenacker
D. Rodriguez

² The Division's administrative rules governing its procurement programs are set forth in N.J.A.C. 17:12. These rules can be accessed at <http://www.state.nj.us/treasury/purchase/AdminCode.shtml>.